



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_AJEA_3650
Title of the Manuscript:	Seed and Seedling Performance of Bread Wheat (<i>Triticum aestivum</i> L.) as Influenced by Rate and In-season Nitrogen Application

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 9 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	This paper presents some interesting data and the experiments are generally well conducted although a large number of studies about the effect of nitrogen rates and time of N application to seed and seedling performance have already undertaken. The points need to be taken into account by the authors: - It should be added more data about the characteristics of seed as influenced by the varieties, rates and time of nitrogen application such as seed weight, a thousand seed weight, time of physiological ripening, chemical content of seed, etc. that will eventually affects the parameters of wheat seed germination. - Provide deeper discussion about the importance of N uptake at anthesis and grain filling which could determine seed quality and then affect seed germination capacity and vigor. - In Data Measurement, Value Cost Ratio mentioned (line 184) and I think it is important, but there is no discussion about that. - For the purpose of nitrogen use efficiency that may related to the Cost Value Ratio, which one is more beneficial to farmers between 90 kg N/ha applied 3 times and 120 kg/ha applied 2 times and 3 times? This point should be discussed.	-Though several studies of N management have conducted on wheat growth, nutrient use and yield, less investigation was done worldwide regarding the effect of the nutrient on seed and seedling growth. -Effect of the nutrient on characteristics of the seed was discussed in terms of the responses of seed germination capacity. Additionally, taking the comments, effects on physical seed quality characteristics (kernels weight and hectolitre weight) were included -The economic analysis, value cost ratio, was excluded as detail data on grain price and input costs are not presented. The interest of this study was to investigate the nutrient effect on seed and seedling growth.



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	- Across all N rates.....application (Lines 291-292), what does it mean?	It is a fragmented idea (graphical error). Removed!
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		